

Devitch Farbotnik  
PO Box 252  
Milford Square, PA 18935

February 23, 2005

Hey Devitch

The records committee did not accept your documentation (video) of the Thayer's Gull at Peace Valley on 3, March 2002. The vote was 2 to accept and 5 to reject. Most members felt the video lacked sufficient detail to rule out a dark Kumlien's (Iceland) Gull. I think Thayer's Gull will become increasingly difficult to document successfully as more is understood of the species evolutionary history. The idea that Kumliens Gull is a hybrid population between Iceland Gull and Thayer's is gaining support and suggests that Kumlien's Gull is possibly even more variable than it already is known to be. At this point there has not been anything published showing the whole range of variation in young birds of either species and it is not very clear where the dividing lines are. Much has been written on tertials, size/shape, and wing-tip patterns but there seems to be much overlap in all these characters.

Thank you sending in the video. This is a case in which it is good to have documentation, even though the committee did not deem it sufficient for a certain identification. I sometimes joke that you personally keep the records committee in business with all the vagrants you find and document.

Sincerely

Matt Sharp  
Chair: Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee.

## Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

### Tabulation Form - Round One

Species: Thayer's Gull (*Larus thayeri*)

Date of Sighting: 3 March 2002 to 3 March 2002

Location: PEACE VALLEY PARK

County: BUCKS

Observer(s): Devich Farbotnik

Date of Submission: 2002

Submitted by: Devich Farbotnik

Written Description: No

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: Video

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead				X				
D. Heathcote					X			
P. Hess					X			
J. Stanley	X							
E. Witmer				X				
R. Leberman					X			
M. Sharp	X							
TOTALS	2			2	3			
DECISION					X			

Comments:

2/5

Signature (Secretary):



Date:

1/18/03